



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov  
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacopini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

## MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE

June 10, 2011

### MINUTES

#### ATTENDANCE

Chair Spering called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 10:12 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Vice Chair Halsted, Commissioners Azumbrado, Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Liccardo, Mackenzie, and Mullin. Commission Chair Tissier and Vice Chair Rein-Worth were present in their ex-officio voting member capacity. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc members of the Committee were Bates, Cortese, Dodd, and Wiener.

ABAG Administrative Committee members in attendance were: Green, Adams, Cortese, Gibson, Gingles, Gioia, Haggerty, Liccardo, Luce, Pierce, and Spering.

#### CONSENT CALENDAR: a) Minutes of May 13, 2011

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval of the Consent Calendar, Commissioner Rien-Worth seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

#### PLAN BY AREA: a) Draft Financial Projections and Proposed Revision to the Committee Funds and Project Policy

Ms. Alix Bockelman provided an update on the Plan Bay Area financial forecast. She stated that based on current projections, the total revenue for the Plan Bay Area period is approximately \$244 billion, which compares with \$218 billion in T2035. She stated that the 28-year timeframe for Plan Bay Area begins in FY 2013 and ends in FY 2040.

Ms. Bockelman summarized the committed and discretionary funding levels, and stated that aligning the draft revenue projections with the approved committed funds policy results in roughly \$68 billion in discretionary funding, compared with roughly \$32 billion in T2035.

Based on partner input and further staff analysis, she recommended the following criteria to the Committed Funds Policy approved by the Commission in April: 1) add county sales tax reauthorization as a committed fund source; 2) add a portion of AB 434 Regional Funds as discretionary and the remainder of the Regional Funds and all of the Local Funds as committed fund sources; 3) add Express Lane revenue for statutorily authorized corridors to the committed fund sources; and 4) add land sales and other developer revenues to committed fund sources.

Ms. Bockelman requested that the committee refer MTC Resolution 4006, Revised, to the full Commission for approval.

Committee comments:

- Commissioner Green commented that the assumption of a single \$1 toll increase over the next 28 years seems low, and noted that committing sales tax funding should coincide with MTC committing to sales tax projects.
- Commissioner Haggerty agreed with Commissioner Green on the Committed Funds.
- Councilmember Pierce noted that some county sales tax projects require discretionary funding for a full funding plan and, therefore, should not be committed.
- Commissioner Azumbrado questioned the reduction of consumption in gasoline to 2020. Mr. Heminger stated that the steep decline is due to a more fuel-efficient fleet being introduced; however fuel consumption rises in the outer years due to population increases.
- Commissioner Haggerty requested that committed projects show percentages of fund shares by fund type and by county.
- Commissioner Liccardo expressed his concern about the \$1 toll increase over 28 years. Mr. Heminger responded that there will likely be multiple bridge toll increases over the next 25 years for toll-bridge specific needs. The one toll increase contemplated in the revenue estimates represents a successor to Regional Measure 2, which assumes a more flexible toll fund that could be used for transit, bikes and other non-bridge specific expenditures.

### **b) Public Workshops Summary**

Ms. Ellen Griffin, MTC, and Ms. Joanna Bullock, ABAG summarized the workshops and online activities in response to release of the Initial Vision Scenario in March 2011. Ms. Griffin stated that staff went to every county in the region to ask people basic questions about their vision for how the region should grow, and the challenges and opportunities they face.

Ms. Bullock stated that 10 public workshops drew 790 participants. MTC partnered with 14 non-profit groups to conduct 1,600 surveys in low-income communities. She noted that there was a strong web presence with 5,400 visits to “You Choose” web tool, 5,700 visits to OneBayArea.org, and the social media drew thousands of views. She noted that many opposing views were expressed, where some felt outreach materials were biased to support more growth. In closing, Ms. Griffin summarized the Planning Process and Timeline, with the Plan adoption in 2013.

### **c) Defining Alternative Scenarios**

Mr. Ken Kirkey, ABAG, and Ashley Nguyen, MTC summarized the comments about the Alternative Scenarios from the Commissioners at the May 13, 2011 Joint MTC/ABAG Committee meeting and from the public input described in the previous agenda item. Mr. Kirkey summarized the five land use options under consideration: 1) Initial Vision Scenario; 2) Core Concentration; 3) Locally Defined Development Pattern; 4) Constrained Core Concentration; and 5) Outer Bay Area Growth.

Ms. Ashley Nguyen summarized the three transportation options under consideration: 1) T2035 Network; 2) Core Transit Capacity Network; and 3) Expanded Network. Ms. Nguyen also highlighted the Policy Initiatives: 1) Transportation Demand Management; 2) Parking Pricing; 3) Climate Initiatives; and 4) Other Strategies to be determined.

In conclusion, Ms. Nguyen summarized the proposed five scenarios that are constructed on a mixing and matching of the land use infrastructure options and the policy initiative options. She requested committee input and action on the scenarios so that staff can begin the technical work.

Public Comment:

- Ms. Mimi Steel requested a complete moratorium on any further activities on the One Bay Area visioning session. She asked for a full accounting of the funding and an audit of the process.
- Mr. Dave Smith expressed his concern that the workshop content was flawed.
- Mr. Sean Ackley expressed his belief that One Bay Area will lead to a pre-determined plan.
- Mr. Newell Arnerich, CCTA, stated his appreciation to MTC and ABAG's commitment to reconsider and further analyze the current employment forecast in light of the continued downturn and recent census data for 2010. He stated that the IVS housing forecast is unrealistic and unachievable.
- Ms. Alia Phelps, ACCE, noted that many areas are not being provided equitable transportation service, and requested staff to include an additional scenario which includes a focus on equity, environment, and jobs.
- Ms. Christina Martin commented on the lack of authentic community involvement.
- Ms. Heather Whittington noted that only 817 residents participated in the workshops; therefore, she does not believe it was a success and it did not accurately reflect what the people of the Bay Area really want.
- Ms. Lois Murdock stated that sustainable development is a term that came from Agenda 21, which is put out by the United Nations. She stated that the Agenda 21 vision is incompatible with the rights and freedoms of the citizens.
- Ms. Pam Farley stated that she believes the One Bay Area outreach process is being used to build a completely fraudulent consensus for a regional plan that transfers power from elected officials to ABAG and MTC.
- Ms. Heather G. stated that the One Bay Area Vision is not a fair process.

After hearing all public comment regarding Item 3a, Commissioner Sperling asked for a motion to approve the Draft Financial Projections and Proposed Revision to the Committed Funds and Project Policy. Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval, Commissioner Halsted seconded. The motion passed with Commissioner Green opposing.

Commissioner Sperling continued with the public comment.

Public Comment:

- Ms. Gaby Miller, Genesis, requested an additional scenario that will maximize the social equity.
- Ms. Parisa Fatehi, Public Advocates, stated that she believes the Sustainable Community Strategy (SCS) alternative scenarios are not complete. She mentioned that the Policy Advisory Council as well as the SCS/RTP Equity Working Group voted to recommend an additional scenario that focuses on social equity.
- Ms. Amber Crabbe, San Francisco County Transportation Authority, commented that SFCTA staff would also like to have roadway pricing be considered, and would like to

see clarity on how the RHNA Methodology Committee work is being reflected in this process.

- Ms. Wafaa Aborashed, Bay Area Healthy 880 Communities, stated that the committee needs to develop a meaningful public participation program.
- Mr. Paul Campos, BIA Bay Area, expressed his concern with MTC and ABAG partnering with stakeholders for the public workshops. He expressed his support of the five identified scenarios, but was concerned that some would not be deemed reasonable by federal agencies.
- Ms. Marilynne Melander expressed her concern with the public participation process.
- Mr. Azibuike Akaba, RAMP, expressed his concern with the scenarios and felt that there has not been enough time to review them. He also stated that an additional scenario on social equity should be included.
- Mr. Marshall Loring, MTC Policy Advisory Committee, stated that there needs to be a consistent definition of the word equity – it is important that the issue of equity be given the attention it deserves.
- Mr. Duane De Witt stated that everyone should look at jobs and employment distribution first and foremost.
- Ms. Stephanie Reyes, Greenbelt Alliance, commented that housing development should be viewed as a job creation strategy.
- Mr. Scott Peterson, Economic Development Alliance of the East Bay, urged staff that the the next phase of this process should include more information and analysis about what can be done to improve job creation and economic development throughout the Bay Area.
- Mr. Jeff Hobson, TransForm, requested that staff study scenarios that can be adopted and support an equity-focused scenario.
- Mr. Vu-Bank Nguyen, Urban Habitat, agrees that evaluating another scenario that includes equity, jobs, and environment would help low-income communities.
- Mr. Sam Tepperman-Gelfant, Public Advocates, requested that the advisory committees' recommendation to include an equity, jobs, and environment scenario be considered.
- Ms. Wendy Alfsen, California Walks – SF Bay Walks, asked that walkable communities be supported.

Based on the extensive public comment, and comments expressed by Commissioners and ABAG Board members, Mr. Heminger suggested that the committees defer action on this item to allow time for staff to respond and report back at a Commission/ABAG Administrative Committee meeting on June 22, 2011.

#### **OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

Ms. Marilynne Melander stated that she believes MTC and ABAG are unconstitutional and lead to increasing centralization of government.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 12:35 p.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, July 8, 2011 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.