



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair
San Mateo County

Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Mark Green
Association of Bay Area Governments

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Kevin Mullin
Cities of San Mateo County

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE/ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
COMMITTEE
June 8, 2012
MINUTES**

ATTENDANCE

Chair Sperring called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 10:31 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Commissioners Azumbrado, Giacopini, Green, Haggerty, Halsted, and Liccardo. Commission Chair Tissier, and Vice-Chair Rein-Worth were present in their ex-officio voting member capacity. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee were Bates, Campos, Cortese, Kinsey, and Wiener.

ABAG Administrative Committee members in attendance were: Directors Cortese, Gioia, Green, Haggerty, Liccardo, Luce, Pierce and Sperring.

CONSENT CALENDAR: a) Minutes of May 11, 2012

Commissioner Liccardo moved approval of the Consent Calendar, Commissioner Halsted seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**HUD REGIONAL SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES PLANNING GRANT
INITIATIVE**

Mr. Ken Kirkey, ABAG, stated that HUD's Sustainable Communities Regional Planning Grants Program supports regional planning that integrates housing, land use, economic and workforce development, transportation, and infrastructure investments. Mr. Doug Johnson, MTC staff commented on the proposed structure of the Steering Committee for the grant, and noted that staff will be requesting the Commission and ABAG's Executive Board to identify three representatives each to serve on the Project Steering Committee. He also stated that there are three Workgroups that will be responsible for the majority of the work. Lastly, Mr. Johnson summarized the grant budget, which totals \$4,991,000 through the period of June 2012 to February 2015.

Committee comments:

- Commissioner Sperring suggested that staff emphasize information to support the grant scope including mapping of where the assisted low-income homes are.
- Commissioner Azumbrado stated that most of HUD's subsidy is Section 8 vouchers, which to his knowledge is not being tracked to see how these vouchers are disbursed throughout the Bay Area.
- Commissioner Green commented that a member of the private sector should be included on the Housing Work Force committee. Mr. Johnson noted that the Homebuilders Association will be participating on this committee.
- In response to questions from Commissioner Kinsey, Mr. Johnson confirmed that the grant funds will provide increased community engagement.

- Commissioner Campos asked about the strategy to address the needs of monolingual communities. Mr. Johnson stated that some of the work is already underway, including a review of information from Work Force Investment Boards and local Economic Development Associations to reach out to those groups and staff welcomes further suggestions from the Commission.
- Commissioner Haggerty agreed with Commissioner Green that homebuilders should be on the committee, and also noted that he would like to see the committee's leadership evolve on its own rather than have the Commission appoint the Chair and Vice-Chair.
- Commissioner Wiener stated that it would be critical to have a broader perspective on moderate and middle income housing, as well as low-income organizations that focus on market production.

PLAN BAY AREA: Environmental Impact Report (EIR) Scope and Alternatives

Ms. Ashley Nguyen presented the purpose and scope for Plan Bay Area. In addition to the EIR, staff will conduct an Equity Analysis to assess the equity implications of all alternatives included in the EIR, and to identify the benefits and burdens of land use impacts and transportation investments for different socioeconomic groups. She noted that the analysis takes place in parallel with the EIR and is slated for completion in early 2013. Staff will also conduct an Economic Impact Analysis to assess economic impacts of the Plan Bay Area's land use patterns and transportation investments on the region's economy. The analysis is slated for completion in fall 2012.

Ms. Nguyen summarized the early input on the EIR alternatives, which indicates that there is a need to assess market feasibility, define the role of public policies to shape market and consumer demands, identify policies that can support local agencies and ensure feasibility, and to study an Environment, Equity, and Jobs Scenario as requested by the stakeholders. She reviewed the provision of SB 375 that allows for CEQA streamlining. Lastly, Ms. Nguyen described the Transit Priority Project (TPP) eligible areas (per SB375) and PDAs, and summarized the power of the Urbansim and travel model analytical tools that will be used to evaluate the EIR alternatives

Mr. Ken Kirkey, ABAG, highlighted the objectives and approach to analyzing the land use alternatives and the transportation alternatives. He summarized the potential EIR alternatives, which are 1) No Project, 2) Jobs-Housing Connection, 3) Network of Transit Neighborhoods, 4) Workforce Housing Opportunities, and 5) Environment, Equity, and Jobs. He also noted that funding would need to be redirected to increase transit service for certain EIR alternatives. In closing, Ms. Nguyen reviewed the schedule for the EIR.

Commissioner Comment:

- Commissioner Cortese commented that the Building Industry Association (BIA) is whether it is possible to structure an alternative that allows some flexibility once the mix of housing types have been established. Mr. Kirkey stated that this approach is being looked at. He noted that this is a 30-year plan that gets updated every 4 years so things will always be subject to revision.

Public Comment:

- Belen Seara, Urban Habitat/6Wins, commended staff for including the Equity, Environment, and Jobs (EE&J) scenario as one possible alternative. She noted that she would like to see a robust EE&J scenario and full transparency in the development and analysis of all the alternatives. Urban Habitat submitted a letter with their detailed requests. She asked that MTC and ABAG disclose the details of the alternatives and the process in which it will finalize those alternatives. She also offered that 6 Wins would work with staff to help develop the details of the EE&J alternative.
- Idin Kashefipour, Public Advocates/6 Wins, commended staff for including the EE&J scenario as a possible alternative. He stated that transparency in this process is critical. He also offered to be involved in the scoping process, but would like to have full disclosure of the details of all the alternatives. He proposed that the transportation plan restore service by 20% above 2005 levels. He also stated that alternative housing be considered that puts housing not only in PDAs but in high opportunity areas that can support workforce housing.
- Manolo Gonzalez-Estay, TransForm, looks forward to working with staff on issues related to displacement in low-income communities. He noted the positive aspects of VMT fees and parking prices. He suggested that staff look at HOV lane conversions for express lanes and that HOV and HOT Network as a whole needs to be considered.
- Jill Ratner, New Voices Are Rising, encouraged staff to reach out to the young people who are going to live with these alternatives.
- Paul Campos, BIA Bay Area, commended staff on the alternatives put forward, but also expressed his concern that the “housing for all” alternative is the only alternative that is paired with pricing strategies - the VMT fee. He also stated that policies in these alternatives that were tested in the T2035 EIR and found to be infeasible, ought not be analyzed again. He also commented that the development of TPPs needs to be part of the EIR alternatives. Lastly, he stated that it’s inappropriate that the No-Project baseline alternative assumes that urban growth boundaries are going to be ignored.
- Catherine Lyons, Bay Area Council, asked staff to consider alternatives to provide significant tiering opportunities for projects separate from the categorical exemptions in terms of the TPP. She further stated that regional air quality and sea-level rise should be considered in detail leaning toward streamlining for a range of projects.

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioner Spering asked if a full assessment will be conducted to deal with the various PDAs and the time it will take to deliver them. Mr. Kirkey responded yes and that along with utilizing Urbansim, MTC and ABAG will also be working very closely with stakeholders on this issue.
- Commissioner Green asked for further explanation and clarification on “feasibility” in the scenarios. Mr. Kirkey responded that the alternatives will be analyzed to better understand feasibility related to financial and implementation perspectives. The EIR will need to bracket the project per CEQA with appropriate alternatives with different growth patterns and have appropriate transportation investment for that growth.
- Mr. Heminger added that cost of increasing transit use/service by 20% would incur hundreds of millions of dollars in additional annual expense. The Plan would have to

identify specific sources of operating assistance or funds that can be shifted to operating purposes.

- Commissioner Campos requested additional information regarding the Equity Analysis. Ms. Nguyen responded that several Equity Analyses have been conducted thus far. She further stated that the intention is to do a similar analysis (to be released in December 2012/January 2013) to evaluate both the proposed project which is the Jobs Housing Connection scenario, as well as the range of alternatives in the EIR. This analysis along with an environmental assessment of the work that is being done and an economic impact report will also be provided to assist in the Plan adoption process. Commissioner Campos asked for the details of the outreach methods will be conducted for maximum community involvement in the Scoping process. Ms. Nguyen responded that there will be a announcements on the website, postcard notifications will be mailed to the stakeholders who participated in the planning process, and pursuant to CEQA requirements, notification to those agencies that are resource agencies, local jurisdictions, and transportation partner agencies.
- Julie Pierce, ABAG Administrative Committee member, commended staff for their work but noted various issues of concern and requested a much more complete definition of the five alternatives before the Committees provides their feedback.
- Commissioner Amy Rein Worth requested that staff provide the details included in the public outreach Scoping sessions and that we use vocabulary that the public can understand and that our narrative provides a clear explanation of what is being presented and what our intent is.
- Mark Luce, ABAG Administrative Committee Chair, asked that the scenario titles should not presume an outcome but describe what is being evaluated and describe the differences among the alternatives.

Public Comment:

The Committees received public comment from the following:

- Manolo Gonzalez Estay – Transform, expressed concern about a potential loophole in funding for CMAs under the One Bay Area Grant Program that could be used to transfer dollars from one project to another.
- Marty Martinez – Safe Routes to Schools National Partnership, referenced Complete Streets policies and Affordable Housing requirements and requested the Commissioner's commitment and support in the adoption of these items by the jurisdictions benefiting from OBAG money.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Commissioner Spring, MTC Chair Tissier and Vice Chair Rein Worth and Ms. Pat Jones, ABAG Assistant Executive Director recognized Doug Kimsey upon his retirement as MTC Planning Director, and thanked him for his service and dedication at MTC. Mr. Kimsey thanked the Commissioners, Committee members and staff.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, July 13, 2012 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.