



Dave Cortese, Chair
Santa Clara County

Jake Mackenzie, Vice Chair
Sonoma County and Cities

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State
Transportation Agency

Libby Schaaf
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

MTC Planning Committee April 10, 2015 Minutes

Attendance

Vice Chair Halsted called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:38 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Commissioners Giacomini, Haggerty, Liccardo, Kinsey, Pierce and Committee Chair Spering. Also in attendance as ex-officio voting members were Commission Chair Cortese and Vice Chair Mackenzie. Commissioners Bates, Campos, Luce and Worth were present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee.

ABAG Administrative Committee members in attendance were: Cortese, Eklund, Gupta, Haggerty, Luce, Mar, Pierce, and Spering.

Note: Commissioner Bates, Cortese and Mackenzie were deputized at the start of the meeting to make a quorum of the MTC Planning Committee.

Consent Calendar

Commissioner Cortese moved approval of the Consent Calendar and Mayor Pro Temp Pierce seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Plan Bay Area Update: Committed Projects and Funds Policy MTC Resolution No. 4182

Adam Noelting and Bill Bacon, of MTC staff, presented, for referral to the Commission, a review and referral of the Committed Projects and Funds Policy for Plan Bay Area 2040.

Public Comment:

- Clarrissa Cabansagan of TransForm thanked staff for the improvements made to the committed projects policy. TransForm requested that all projects be subject to performance assessments.

Committee discussion:

- In response to Commissioner Cortese's question regarding the current, adopted Plan Bay Area, Mr. Noelting responded that the September 30, 2015 due date for fund project submittals included in the materials, would allow more projects to become eligible, relative to the current Plan.

Plan Bay Area Update: Committed Projects and Funds Policy MTC Resolution No. 4182 (cont'd)

Mayor Pro Temp Pierce moved to refer the Plan Bay Area Update: Committed Projects and Funds Policy MTC Resolution No. 4182 to the full Commission for approval and Commissioner Cortese seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Plan Bay Area Forecast and Modeling Approach

Cynthia Kroll of ABAG presented background information and an overview of the development of the growth forecast of population, jobs, and housing for Plan Bay Area 2040.

Committee discussion:

- ABAG Administrative Committee member Eklund inquired as to the relationship between the Department of Finance (DOF) projects and forecast. Ms. Kroll stated ABAG has been in touch with the DOF. Committee member Eklund also questioned to what extent ABAG is going to ensure that elected officials are going to be engaged in the process. Miriam Chion, ABAG Planning and Research Director, stated that the local planning directors are being asked to present materials to local councils so local elected officials can remain engaged. Additionally, ABAG will keep bringing materials to this forum, the Regional Planning Committee and Executive Board.
- ABAG Administrative Committee member Pradeep Gupta emphasized the importance of data consistency in migratory patterns with respect to the regions outside of the Bay Area. Committee member Gupta also requested that the changing patterns of women entering the workforce be included in the labor force participation assumptions.
- Commissioner Mackenzie requested the program include a specific presentation to each of the congestion management agencies.
- Commissioner Haggerty urged the committees to ensure that the agencies work with other jurisdictions outside of the nine county Bay Area and also look at workforce migration in and out of the nine counties. He expressed concern that the settlement agreement might make this a difficult task, particularly from the Central Valley as it relates to in-commuting.

Public Comment:

- Bob Glover, Executive Officer with the Building Industry Association of the Bay Area (BIA), referenced the letter sent from BIA legal counsel regarding the concerns of the settlement agreement between ABAG, MTC and BIA. The BIA requested a response outlining how ABAG and MTC intend to comply with the settlement as it pertains to this issue.
- John Shwark of the San Francisco Bay Area Renters Federation (SFBARF) expressed concern for people who are housing challenged and are not taken into consideration in the Plan.
- Michael Ege of SFBARF commented on the exclusion of workforce housing in the Plan.

Plan Bay Area Forecast and Modeling Approach (cont'd)

Committee discussion:

- Michael Tye of SFBARF commented on the difficulty for technology sector workers to find and keep well-paying jobs in the Bay Area given the Bay Area's very high housing cost.
- In response to Bob Glover's comment, Committee member Eklund questioned if ABAG or MTC had looked at housing availability and the relationship to the cost of rent over time. Ms. Kroll assured the committees that the changes in rent are being tracked.
- Commissioner Rein Worth commented that the Bay Area is challenged with the lack of affordable housing. She also requested the information be broken down by the stages of life.
- Commissioner Campos welcomed SFBARF to the committee meeting and said he looks forward to having a good dialogue given the different perspectives on the housing issues they raise.
- Commissioner Luce stated that comments heard from the public today reflect reality and experience that the middle class is being squeezed out. He requested ABAG and MTC refocus and reexamine the model used over the years, and look at how they address the issue of housing and affordability.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Ken Kirkey, MTC Planning Director, informed the committee that the Operations Committee has requested to meet prior to the Planning and ABAG Administrative Committee meeting in May. There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 11:03 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, May 8, 2015 at 10:00 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.

J:\COMMITTEE\Planning Committee\2015\May\02a_Minutes.docx