METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
EMAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Agenda Item 4a

Dave Cortese, Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development

Jason Baker
Cities of Santa Clara County

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Napa County and Cities

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Julie Pierce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Bijan Sartipi
California State Transportation Agency

Libby Schaaf
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE
February 13, 2015
MINUTES

ATTENDANCE

Chair Spering called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Commissioners Aguirre, Azumbrado, Giacopini, Haggerty, Halsted, Liccardo, Mackenzie and Pierce. Commission Chair Rein-Worth and Vice-Chair Cortese were present in their ex-officio voting member capacity. Commissioner Bates, Campos, and Wiener were present as ad hoc non-voting members of the Committee.

ABAG Administrative Committee members in attendance were: Cortese, Eklund, Grupta, Haggerty, Liccardo, Mar, Pierce, Rabbitt, and Spering.

CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of January 9, 2015

Commissioner Pierce moved approval of the Consent Calendar and Commissioner Mackenzie seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

FINAL DRAFT MTC PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

Ms. Ellen Griffin summarized the comments received on the Preliminary Draft 2015 Public Participation Plan and described the revisions in response to comments. She also presented a handout to incorporate the names of the different transit operators that receive federal funding through MTC's Program of Projects. She requested the Planning Committee forward MTC Resolution No. 4174 to the Commission to adopt the final MTC 2015 Public Participation Plan.

Mr. Brad Paul, ABAG, expressed their support of the Draft 2015 Public Participation Plan and noted that ABAG has been working closely with MTC staff on the outreach activities related to the Plan update.

Commissioner Spering called for public comment.

Public Comment:

Mr. Duane DeWitt spoke in support of a good outcome for the City of Roseland neighborhood in Santa Rosa. He noted that over the years it has become a Priority Development Area, but the City of Santa Rosa is not focused on the neighborhood and its qualities, but instead at the complementary funding. He requested that MTC and ABAG get the City of Santa Rosa's attention to have them abide by what they are supposed to do to achieve Plan Bay Area goals.

- Ken Bukowski stated that providing video for committee meetings is an important piece of public participation, and requested staff to accommodate this by providing a link to his site.

Committee discussion:

- Commissioner Spering asked how staff can customize these meetings in the local jurisdictions. Ms. Griffin stated that staff is talking with the CMA Planning Directors and there is agreement that they will be participating in the meetings that staff will have in May. There is discussion about an open house format. Staff wants to work with the CMAs on the transportation piece and partner with localities on the local land use.
- Commissioner Spering requested that staff contact the ABAG representative of each county so they are in the loop as to what the planning process is with the CMAs.
- ABAG member Mar expressed his support for the Public Participation Plan.
- ABAG member Eklund noted some internal inconsistencies between the narrative and Attachment B. Ms. Griffin stated that on Page 32 there are a few places where the text in the roles and responsibilities are inconsistent with what is in Attachment B. Staff will make sure that Attachment B is consistent with what is in the text.
- ABAG board member Eklund requested staff to agendize a discussion on the more detailed implementation strategy that will help guide them on how to engage the public.
- ABAG board member Gupta suggested a more formal approach specifying how the local comments are included, or not included, as well as the data and references that could be useful to that local jurisdiction. Performance monitoring is a very important aspect of the plan.
- Commissioner Pierce responded to ABAG board member Grupta's comments and noted that that level of specificity may not need to be part of the Public Participation Plan, but it certainly should be part of the strategy going forward to develop the final Plan for the 2017 adoption.
- Commissioner Mackenzie noted that this Public Participation Plan represents a joint agency approach. He also commented on Page 19, ABAG's Delegate Meetings, and requested that MTC staff be represented at those meetings.
- Commissioner Campos asked when the Equity Work Group will be convened, and secondly how/when will staff reach out to non-english speakers. Mr. Kirkey stated that the Equity Working Group is slated to reconvene in the spring. Ms. Griffin stated that staff recently released a proposal seeking assistance from groups who work in low-income communities and communities of color to assist staff in reaching out to them. She noted that staff has partnered with CBO's in the past.
- Commissioner Haggerty stated that it is not convenient for the public to be at the meetings on a weekday, and asked staff if there is a way to push more of these meetings towards the evening time. Ms. Griffin stated that all meetings that were held for the general public regarding the plan have been in the evening or on Saturday. In terms of MTC and ABAG committee meetings this is a larger decision beyond the scope of the Draft Public Participation Plan. Commissioner Haggerty suggested that when there are very distinct criteria that may affect people and will be discussed at a meeting, then staff should use their judgment and, when possible, schedule that particular meeting in the evening.

- Commissioner Spering commented on the response from staff regarding a comment about MTC's composition, and suggested expanding on that response to note the process at the local level to appoint Commissioners.

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval to forward MTC Resolution No. 4174 to the full Commission for adoption. Commissioner Aguirre seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA CRITERIA

Mr. Ken Kirkey stated that this presentation is a follow up on a discussion at the ABAG Executive Board where the transit criteria and other criteria for Priority Development Areas (PDAs) was discussed. The Board is seeking MTC's input on that criteria, and will then adopt the PDA criteria and any changes they might consider. He introduced Mr. Mark Shorett, ABAG, who presented the criteria used to establish and refine the Bay Area's PDAs.

Committee discussion:

- Commissioner Haggerty stated that he is aware of places where people are walking one mile to a BART station in a community that is thriving, but one of the things the report missed the most is those who are biking. He asked if this is at odds with ABAG's understanding of the ½ mile, where the PDA criteria would apply.
- Commissioner Wiener asked what the experience has been in terms of where the PDAs should be in terms of who is coming forward and volunteering. Ms. Chion stated that some of that analysis is done in the PDA investment and growth strategy report. She also noted that there are very few areas that will be left for PDA consideration in terms of transit accessibility, but it is a combination of the transit component, the existing infrastructure as well as the desire to produce housing in those locations. Commissioner Wiener requested a list of any BART or Caltrain stations that are not PDAs.
- Commissioner Aguirre noted that many cities had PDAs before it was popular, and there will be many cities that will never have PDAs and will never reach their RHNA numbers because of their geography where there is no place to build near the transit station.
- ABAG Committee member Eklund asked why a community could not be given the flexibility to have a PDA that is a mile radius if in fact that particular community would like to have a PDA that large. Ms. Chion stated that the intent of the PDAs is to link access to transit, and access to alternative modes of transportation with housing. The criteria of ½ mile is supported by the research in terms of how far people walk or bike, on average, and make the effort to shift from car to transit.
- Commissioner Azumbrado stated that as staff looks at 2040 and the number of low-income individuals, there will not necessarily be a choice in terms of what the walking abilities are.
- Commissioner Mackenzie stated that a 180 acre PDA in Rohnert Park qualified due to the geography of the railroad tracks – the main east/west arterial Rohnert Park expressway.
- Commissioner Pierce stated that it's all about local control to have a PDA. If a PDA is to qualify for the incentive funding, then it has to have the PDA within ½ mile of transit. She supported this criteria.
- Commissioner Giacopini stated that it's important to keep in mind that the work force is getting older and the ability of people to walk long distances and bike will be significantly different for workers in their 20's and 30's then it is for workers in their 50's and 60's.

- ABAG Committee member Rabbitt encouraged staff to maintain the flexibility with the ½ mile radius.
- Commissioner Liccardo commented on the description of how the definition near transit changed in 2010, and asked about the number of PDAs that were grandfathered and don't meet the newer 2010 definition. Ms. Chion stated that based on the analysis most of the PDAs would qualify under the 2010 definition.
- Commissioner Bates stated that the walkability issue around transit is extremely important. More young people are not getting a driver's license because they do not need or want a car.
- Commissioner Worth stated that PDAs will have different characteristics in urban and suburban PDAs and she hopes that staff will continue to look at the requirements for the bus service because those are very flexible.

Public comment:

- Mr. Duane DeWitt stated that vehicle miles traveled and people using their private vehicle are increasing in the Roseland PDA. There will not be a change unless the planning department increases density in the area.
- Mr. Mark Green stated that BART mentioned that they had their own research showing that in terms of rental income, leasing income, and even attached sales on the resale value that with the ¼ mile radius at many of their stations they are getting double digit increases. It starts to decrease after the ½ mile radius. As BART expands, and in terms of housing and transportation, there should be some nexus that both ABAG and MTC should be looking at. If BART is producing greater income for the landlords and developers of those areas, it's worth looking how to tap into that revenue stream.

Commissioner Spering, a member of the ABAG Administrative Committee, moved approval of staff's recommendation and that it be forward to the ABAG Executive Board for approval. Commissioner Cortese, a member of the ABAG Administrative Committee, seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 11:13 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, March 13, 2015 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.

J:\COMMITTE\Planning Committee\2015\March\4a_Minutes.doc